April 2018

# OPPORTUNITIES FOR CAREER EDUCATION TO CLOSE THE MIDDLE-SKILL JOBS GAP IN SAN DIEGO COUNTY 

## Table of Contents

Introduction. ..... 1
Significance of Middle-Skill Jobs in San Diego County ..... 3
Top Middle-Skill Jobs ..... 4
Program Supply for Top Middle-Skill Jobs ..... 8
Key Findings and Recommendations. ..... 13
Recommendations for Short-Term Certificate Programs ..... 15
Programs Recommended for Increased Awards. ..... 19
Recommendations for Further Analysis. ..... 26
Appendix A: Data Definitions ..... 28
Appendix B: Demand, Supply and Gaps - Definitions and Methodology ..... 29
Appendix C: Top 100 Middle-Skill Jobs in San Diego County ..... 33

## About the Centers of Excellence

This study was funded by Strong Workforce Program funds and produced by the Centers of Excellence (COE) for Labor Market Research. The COE are funded in part by the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, Economic and Workforce Development (EWD) Program. One of the goals of EWD is to "support the regional alignment between the Career Technical Education programs of the community college system and the needs of California's Priority and Emerging Sectors." ${ }^{\text {" }}$ The COE supports this goal by delivering regional workforce research and technical expertise to the California Community Colleges for program decision-making and resource development. More information about the Centers of Excellence is available at coeccc.net.

1. Economic and Workforce Development Program. Annual Report. California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office. 2017

## Important Disclaimers

All representations included in this report have been produced from primary research and/or secondary review of publicly and/or privately available data and/or research reports. Efforts have been made to qualify and validate the accuracy of the data and the report findings; however, neither the Centers of Excellence, COE host district, nor California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office are responsible for the applications or decisions made by individuals and/or organizations based on this study or its recommendations.
© 2018 California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, Economic and Workforce Development Program


CENTERS OF EXCELLENCE Inform Connect Advance

## Prepared by:

Tina Ngo Bartel
Director
Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research
San Diego-Imperial Region

## Introduction

In 2015, San Diego County's local Workforce Development Board conducted a study on the region's middle-skill jobs and identified that approximately 35 percent of "San Diegans ages 25 and older lack the post-secondary credentials to fill middle-skill job openings"l and that more than 38 percent of households earn below the Self-Sufficiency Standard, the amount needed to meet basic living needs in San Diego County without public assistance. ${ }^{2}$ Community colleges have the potential to close this "jobs gap" with Career Education ${ }^{3}$ programs. By providing training for the top middle-skill jobs, the community colleges can help workers progress into careers that provide a living wage and provide employers with qualified employees as they compete in a global economy. ${ }^{4}$

Public Career Education programs have already been proven to benefit students and workers. A recent report by the Brookings Institution analyzed labor market outcomes and debt incurred by students who completed Career Education programs across the United States and found that "public sector students outperform for-profit students on nearly every measure, suggesting that the overwhelming majority of for-profit students would be better off attending a public institution." ${ }^{5}$

Beyond the national level, this study aims to understand where the middle-skill job opportunities are in San Diego County and explores job gaps (or labor supply gaps) that could potentially be filled with public Career Education programs.


[^0]
## Significance of Middle-Skill Jobs in San Diego County

Middle-skill jobs constitute a significant portion of the San Diego labor market. In 2017, 36 percent of the $1,583,115$ jobs in San Diego County were middle-skill jobs and 21 percent were above-middle-skill jobs (Figure 1). ${ }^{6}$

Figure 1. Jobs Breakdown in San Diego County, 2017


Middle-skill jobs have median hourly earnings ${ }^{7}$ of $\$ 22.10$, which is higher than the self-sufficient hourly wage for a single adult to minimally meet basic living needs without public assistance (\$13.09), ${ }^{8}$ and higher than the average median hourly earnings of all jobs (\$19.30) in the region (Figure 2). ${ }^{9}$

Figure 2. Median Hourly Earnings vs. Self-Sufficiency Standard

| $\$ 22.10$ | $\$ 19.30$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Middle-Skill Jobs | All Jobs | Self-Sufficiency <br> Standard |
|  |  |  |

San Diego County employers have difficulty filling middle-skill jobs. Between January and December 2017, employers posted 2.21 million online job postings for middle-skill jobs. Only 348,419 of these job postings were unique, which indicates that, on average, an employer posted a job six times in an effort to fill the position. Comparatively, employers posted 1.5 million online job postings for above-middle-skill jobs, and only 280,586 were unique. ${ }^{10}$

## Defining Middle-Skill Jobs

To define "middle-skill jobs," the Centers of Excellence for Labor Market Research across the state of California examined 867 occupational codes from the Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) ${ }^{1}$ system and classified 298 occupational codes as "middle-skill jobs" and 204 codes as "above-middle-skill jobs."

Middle-skill jobs include:

- All occupations that require an educational requirement of some college, associate degree or apprenticeship;
- All occupations that require a bachelor's degree, but also have more than one-third of their existing labor force with an educational attainment of some college or associate degree; or
- All occupations that require a high school diploma or equivalent or no formal education, but also require short- to long-term on-the-job training where multiple community colleges have existing programs.

Above-middle-skill jobs include occupations that require an educational attainment of a bachelor's degree or higher (excluding those in the middle-skills jobs category, as defined above).

For more information about the definition of middle-skill and above-middle-skill ¡obs, see Appendix B.

1 "The 2018 Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) system is a federal statistical standard used by federal agencies to classify workers into occupational categories for the purpose of collecting, calculating, or disseminating data." (bls.gov/soc)

[^1]Not only do employers have difficulty filling existing middle-skill jobs, but they will also experience hiring challenges as these middle-skill jobs grow. Between 2017 and 2022, the number of middle-skill jobs in the region is projected to increase by 41,450 jobs or seven percent (Figure 3). ${ }^{11}$

Figure 3. Number of People Employed in Middle-Skill and Above-Middle-Skill Jobs in San Diego County


## Top Middle-Skill Jobs

To better understand employers' needs, this study analyzes the top middle-skill jobs and their supply gaps and makes recommendations for program development. "Top jobs" are occupations that have the most labor market demand, stable employment growth, and entry-level wages at or above the Self-Sufficiency Standard. The top 100 middle-skill jobs have the following characteristics:

- Most number of annual openings between 2017 and 2022
- Entry-level hourly earnings ( $25^{\text {th }}$ percentile) greater than or equal to $\$ 13.09$
- No employment decline between 2017 and 2022

Table 1 lists the top 100 middle-skill jobs that are analyzed in this study. (For specific details on each top middle-skill job, including wages, job growth and educational requirements, see Appendix C.) Occupational titles in Table 1 with an asterisk (*) have an oversupply of labor. The remaining occupations have supply gaps. A supply gap indicates that there is more labor market demand than labor market supply for an occupation. Conversely, a labor surplus (oversupply) indicates that there is more labor market supply than labor demand.

## Labor Market Demand: Annual Openings

Annual (job) openings are used to determine labor market demand. This number estimates employment change and turnover for an occupation each year between 2017 and 2022. Annual openings include:

- Job Growth: An employer experiences increased demand for products and hires new employees to increase production. If job growth is zero or negative, then any and all openings are due to replacement needs.
- Replacement Needs: An employer hires replacement workers for employees who leave the workforce or change occupations. Replacement rates are derived from national 10-year, occupation-specific percentages published by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics Employment Projections program.

[^2]
## Defining Top Middle-Skill Jobs

"Top jobs" are occupations that have the most labor market demand, stable employment growth, and entrylevel wages at or above the Self-Sufficiency Standard. The most labor market demand is defined as the highest number of annual job openings between 2017 and 2022. For more information about annual openings, see "Labor Market Demand: Annual Openings." Stable employment growth indicates that an occupation is projected to have no employment decline between 2017 and 2022. Entry-level wages are the hourly earnings, excluding benefits, that the $25^{\text {th }}$ percentile of current workers within an occupation make. Only occupations with entry-level wages of at least $\$ 13.09$ per hour were included in this study because they allowed entry-level workers to earn a self-sufficient wage.

In addition to listing the labor market demand for the top 100 middle-skill jobs, Table 1 also illustrates their relationship to the California Community Colleges' Priority and Emerging Sectors. According to the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, 10 industry sectors merit priority in terms of resources and program development due to their "labor market needs and opportunities to prepare students to complete in a global economy." 12 These Priority and Emerging Sectors include:

- Advanced Manufacturing
- Business \& Entrepreneurship
- Energy, Construction \& Utilities
- Health Care
- Life Sciences
- Global Trade
- Tourism
- Agricultural, Water \& Environmental Technologies
- Information and Communication Technologies \& Digital Media
- Advanced Transportation and Logistics


## Top Jobs' Relationship to Priority and Emerging Sectors

Table 1 defines the top 100 middle-skill jobs' relationship to the Priority and Emerging Sectors in two ways:

- The top middle-skill job is also a top job in one of the sectors based on staffing patterns
- The top middle-skill job is also a sector-specific job based on feedback from industry experts

To find the top jobs in the Priority and Emerging Sectors, the Centers of Excellence (COE) first defined each sector by North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) codes. NAICS is the standard used by federal statistical agencies to collect, analyze and publish data related to the industry sectors. An industry sector is defined as a group of businesses that produce similar goods and services and share similar production processes for creating the goods and services they sell. After defining the industry sectors, the COE conducted a staffing patterns analysis to identify the top 100 jobs in each sector. According to the California Employment Development Department, "Staffing patterns are a list of the occupations employed within a particular industry, or a list of the industries that employ a particular occupation." These staffing patterns were then crossreferenced with the top 100 middle-skill jobs in Table 1. Additionally, industry experts reviewed the top 100 middle-skill jobs in Table 1 and provided feedback on their importance in each sector. Table 1 illustrates these relationships from the quantitative and qualitative analyses with a notation ( $\cdot$ ).

[^3]Draft

## Table 1. Top 100 Middle-Skill Jobs by Labor Market Demand Within Priority and Emerging Sectors

```
* = Oversupply
AM = Advanced Manufacturing
BE = Business & Entrepreneurship
ECU = Energy, Construction & Utilities
```

HC = Health Care
LS = Life Sciences
GT = Global Trade
T = Tourism

AWET = Agricultural, Water \& Environmental Technologies
ICT = Information and Communication Technologies
ATL $=$ Advanced Transportation and Logistics
2017-22 AM BE ECU HC LS GT T AWET ICT ATL

43-4051 Customer Service Representatives
43-6014 Secretaries and Administrative Assistants, Except Legal,
29-1141
43-1011
41-3099
41-1011
13-1199
49-9071
31-9092
47-2031
41-4012 Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing,
Except Technical and Scientific Products
43-6013 Medical Secretaries
47-2111 Electricians
53-3032 Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers
39-9031 Fitness Trainers and Aerobics Instructors
47-2152 Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters
43-6011 Executive Secretaries \& Executive Admin Assistants
47-1011 First-Line Supervisors of Construction Trades and Extraction Workers
51-9061 Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers
29-2061
41-3021
15-1151 Insurance Sales Agents
31-9091 Dental Assistants
43-5061
51-1011
$51-404$
$33-305$
23-2011
51-412
21-1093
13-1023 Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm
11-9021 Construction Managers*
53-3022 Bus Drivers, School or Special Client
51-2022 Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers
49-9021 Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics
41-1012 First-Line Supervisors of Non-Retail Sales Workers
13-1051
11-3011
15-1199
11-9141 Property, Real Estate, and Community Association Managers
29-2052 Pharmacy Technicians
49-1011 First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, \& Repairers
43-6012 Legal Secretaries
47-2211 Sheet Metal Workers
35-1011 Chefs and Head Cooks*
39-1021 First-Line Supervisors of Personal Service Workers*
13-1081 Logisticians
33-3012 Correctional Officers and Jailers
13-2072 Loan Officers
17-3023 Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians

Annual
Openings

Table 1. Top 100 Middle-Skill Jobs by Labor Market Demand Within Priority and Emerging Sectors (Continued)

| * = Oversupply HC = Health Care <br> AM = Advanced Manufacturing LS = Life Sciences <br> BE = Business \& Entrepreneurship GT = Global Trad <br> ECU = Energy, Construction \& Utilities $\mathrm{T}=$ Tourism |  | AWET $=$ Agricultural, Water \& Environmental Technologies <br> ICT = Information and Communication Technologies <br> ATL $=$ Advanced Transportation and Logistics |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SOC | Occupational Title | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | AM | BE | ECU | HC | LS | GT | T | AWET | ICT | ATL |
| 31-9099 | Healthcare Support Workers, All Other | 259 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 47-2073 | Operating Engineers \& Other Construction Equipment Operators | 256 |  |  | - |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| 13-1031 | Claims Adjusters, Examiners, and Investigators | 255 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13-1151 | Training and Development Specialists | 252 | - | - |  | - | - | - | - |  |  | - |
| 15-1142 | Network and Computer Systems Administrators* | 251 | $\bullet$ |  |  |  | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ |  |  | $\bullet$ | - |
| 15-1134 | Web Developers | 239 |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ | - |  |  | - |  |
| 33-2011 | Firefighters* | 237 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 33-3021 | Detectives and Criminal Investigators | 228 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29-2012 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technicians | 228 |  |  |  | $\bullet$ | - |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29-2099 | Health Technologists and Technicians, All Other | 227 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 49-9041 | Industrial Machinery Mechanics | 227 | - |  | - |  | - | - |  | - |  | - |
| 27-4021 | Photographers | 219 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | - |
| 31-9097 | Phlebotomists | 211 |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29-2021 | Dental Hygienists | 205 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 43-3051 | Payroll and Timekeeping Clerks* | 201 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 49-3031 | Bus and Truck Mechanics and Diesel Engine Specialists | 200 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | - |  | - |
| 43-4131 | Loan Interviewers and Clerks | 186 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 43-4161 | Human Resources Assistants, Except Payroll \& Timekeeping | 182 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 43-4181 | Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks | 180 |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  | - |
| 27-3091 | Interpreters and Translators | 179 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29-2071 | Medical Records and Health Information Technicians | 178 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 49-3021 | Automotive Body and Related Repairers | 176 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 37-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Landscaping, Lawn Service, and Groundskeeping Workers | 171 |  |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |
| 51-4011 | Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators, Metal and Plastic | 165 | - |  |  |  | $\bullet$ | - |  | $\bullet$ | - | - |
| 25-4031 | Library Technicians | 164 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 47-4011 | Construction and Building Inspectors | 155 |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  | - |
| 53-1031 | First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and MaterialMoving Machine and Vehicle Operators | 153 |  |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |
| 13-1022 | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products | 152 |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  |
| 17-3029 | Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other | 150 | - |  | $\bullet$ |  | $\bullet$ | - |  |  | - | - |
| 17-3011 | Architectural and Civil Drafters | 146 |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |
| 15-1152 | Computer Network Support Specialists | 145 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |
| 11-3051 | Industrial Production Managers | 144 | $\bullet$ | - |  |  | - | $\bullet$ |  | - |  | $\bullet$ |
| 53-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Helpers, Laborers, and Material Movers, Hand | 143 |  |  |  |  |  | - |  | - |  |  |
| 51-2011 | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging \& Systems Assemblers | 142 |  |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  | - |
| 13-2082 | Tax Preparers* | 141 |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 49-3011 | Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians | 137 | - |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  | - |
| 29-2011 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technologists | 135 |  |  |  | - | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29-2034 | Radiologic Technologists | 129 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 19-4099 | Life, Physical, and Social Science Technicians, All Other | 126 |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |
| 29-2056 | Veterinary Technologists and Technicians* | 125 |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 31-2021 | Physical Therapist Assistants | 122 |  |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 43-5011 | Cargo and Freight Agents | 120 |  |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  | - |
| 11-9081 | Lodging Managers | 113 |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |
| 51-8031 | Water and Wastewater Treatment Plant and System Operators | 104 |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |
| 47-2221 | Structural Iron and Steel Workers | 103 |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17-3022 | Civil Engineering Technicians | 102 |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |
| 15-1143 | Computer Network Architects | 101 | - |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  | - | $\bullet$ |
| 29-2055 | Surgical Technologists | 101 |  |  |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 47-2121 | Glaziers | 99 |  |  | - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11-3071 | Transportation, Storage, and Distribution Managers | 99 |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |  | - |  | $\bullet$ |  |  |
|  | Total Labor Market Demand | 45,457 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## Program Supply for Top Middle-Skill Jobs

Labor market demand for the top middle-skill jobs amounts to $45,457^{13}$ job openings each year between 2017 and 2022. To determine whether there are enough qualified workers to meet this labor market demand, this study examines potential labor supply from the educational institutions in the region. Supply for an occupation can be estimated by analyzing the number of program completers or awards in a related Taxonomy or Programs (TOP) or Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP) code. There are 172 six-digit TOP (TOP6) program codes related to the middle-skill jobs analyzed in this study. Table 2 lists the top middle-skill jobs and their related programs in the region. Because a TOP code or program may train for more than one occupation, simply aggregating all supply from a related TOP code may overestimate supply for that occupation. For example, TOP6 code 050940 Sales and Salesmanship trains for both Customer Service Representatives (43-4051) and Sales Representatives, Services, All Other (41-3099). Therefore, 050940 Sales and Salesmanship was omitted from Sales Representatives, Services, All Other in Table 2 because it was already accounted for in Customer Service Representatives. Table 2 analyzes program supply for the top middle-skill jobs with this method, removing duplicate codes whenever necessary.

## Labor Market Supply: Program Awards

Program award data represents the supply of students that can potentially fill labor market demand. Supply can be estimated by analyzing Taxonomy of Programs (TOP) and Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP) codes. TOP is a system of numerical codes used at the state level to collect and report information on community college programs and courses throughout the state that have similar outcomes. TOP was designed to aggregate information about programs, but local program titles often differ substantially from college to college. For example, one college's program may be titled "Mechanized Agriculture," another college's program may be titled "Agriculture Engineering Technology," and a third college's program may be titled "Agriculture Equipment Operations \& Maintenance." Because they have similar outcomes, information on all three is collected and reported at the state level under TOP code 011600 , which carries the standardized title "Agricultural Power Equipment Technology."

Other educational institutional programs were identified using CIP codes and then cross-walked to TOP codes. CIP codes are a taxonomy of academic disciplines at institutions of higher education in the United States and Canada. CIP codes are used at the federal level and for non-community-college programs. The CIP was originally developed by the National Center for Education Statistics of the United States Department of Education. For more information about the differences between TOP and CIP codes, see Appendix B.

[^4]Draft
Table 2. Labor Market Demand vs. Program Supply for the Top 100 Middle-Skill Jobs in San Diego County
"--" indicates that the TOP code(s) for that job was(were) omitted and accounted for elsewhere in the table
" 0 " indicates that a program for that TOP code exists in the region, but there was no supply
"N/A" indicates that no program exists for that TOP code in the region

| SOC | Occupational Title | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | Supply Gap or Oversupply | 2013-15 Average Awards | TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 43-4051 | Customer Service Representatives | 2,920 | Supply Gap | 5 | 050940 | Sales and Salesmanship |
| 43-6014 | Secretaries and Administrative Assistants, Except Legal, Medical, and Executive | 2,683 | Supply Gap | 1,206 | 051400 | Office Technology/ Office Computer Applications |
| 29-1141 | Registered Nurses | 1,810 | Supply Gap | 553 | 120310 | Registered Nursing |
| 43-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers | 1,743 | Supply Gap | 9 | $\begin{aligned} & 050630 \\ & 050970 \\ & 051440 \end{aligned}$ | Management Development and Supervision <br> E-Commerce (Business Emphasis) Office Management |
| 41-3099 | Sales Representatives, Services, All Other | 1,578 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 41-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers | 1,542 | Supply Gap | 78 | 050650 | Retail Store Operations and Management |
| 13-1199 | Business Operations Specialists, All Other | 1,439 | Supply Gap | 59 | 050640 | Small Business and Entrepreneurship |
| 49-9071 | Maintenance and Repair Workers, General | 1,303 | Supply Gap | 0 | 094500 | Industrial Systems Technology and Maintenance |
| 31-9092 | Medical Assistants | 1,180 | Oversupply | 1,396 | $\begin{aligned} & 120800 \\ & 120810 \end{aligned}$ | Medical Assisting Clinical Medical Assisting |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters | 1,178 | Supply Gap | 99 | $\begin{aligned} & 095210 \\ & 095250 \end{aligned}$ | Carpentry <br> Mill and Cabinet Work |
| 41-4012 | Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | 1,132 | Supply Gap | 87 | $\begin{aligned} & 130320 \\ & 050800 \\ & 050900 \end{aligned}$ | Fashion Merchandising International Business and Trade Marketing and Distribution |
| 43-6013 | Medical Secretaries | 1,058 | Supply Gap | 405 | $\begin{aligned} & 051420 \\ & 120820 \\ & 122310 \end{aligned}$ | Medical Office Technology <br> Administrative Medical Assisting <br> Health Information Coding |
| 47-2111 | Electricians | 1,026 | Supply Gap | 115 | 095220 | Electrical |
| 53-3032 | Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers | 988 | Supply Gap | N/A | 094750 | Truck and Bus Driving |
| 39-9031 | Fitness Trainers and Aerobics Instructors | 835 | Supply Gap | 125 | $\begin{aligned} & 083500 \\ & 083510 \\ & 083520 \\ & 083550 \\ & 083560 \\ & 083580 \\ & 083700 \\ & 122800 \end{aligned}$ | Physical Education <br> Physical Fitness and Body Movement <br> Fitness Trainer <br> Intercollegiate Athletics <br> Coaching <br> Adapted Physical Education <br> Health Education <br> Athletic Training and Sports Medicine |
| 47-2152 | Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters | 799 | Supply Gap | 221 | 095230 | Plumbing, Pipefitting and Steamfitting |
| 43-6011 | Executive Secretaries and Executive Administrative Assistants | 768 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 47-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Construction Trades and Extraction Workers | 732 | Supply Gap | 26 | $\begin{aligned} & 095260 \\ & 095280 \\ & 210210 \end{aligned}$ | Masonry, Tile, Cement, Lath and Plaster <br> Drywall and Insulation <br> Public Works |
| 51-9061 | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers | 650 | Supply Gap | 0 | $\begin{aligned} & 095500 \\ & 095680 \end{aligned}$ | Laboratory Science Technology Industrial Quality Control |
| 29-2061 | Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses | 645 | Supply Gap | 378 | 123020 | Licensed Vocational Nursing |
| 41-3021 | Insurance Sales Agents | 554 | Supply Gap | 0 | 051200 | Insurance |
| 15-1151 | Computer User Support Specialists | 548 | Supply Gap | 39 | $\begin{aligned} & 070210 \\ & 070800 \\ & 070820 \end{aligned}$ | Software Applications <br> Computer Infrastructure and Support <br> Computer Support |
| 31-9091 | Dental Assistants | 533 | Supply Gap | 410 | 124010 | Dental Assistant |
| 43-5061 | Production, Planning, and Expediting Clerks | 505 | Supply Gap | 3 | 051000 | Logistics and Materials Transportation |
| 51-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers | 474 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |


| SOC | Occupational Title | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | Supply Gap or Oversupply | 2013-15 Average Awards | TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 51-4041 | Machinists | 447 | Supply Gap | 54 | 095630 | Machining and Machine Tools |
| 33-3051 | Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers | 398 | Supply Gap | 81 | 210550 | Police Academy |
| 23-2011 | Paralegals and Legal Assistants | 397 | Supply Gap | 72 | 140200 | Paralegal |
| 51-4121 | Welders, Cutters, Solderers, and Brazers | 397 | Supply Gap | 343 | 095650 | Welding Technology |
| 21-1093 | Social and Human Service Assistants | 391 | Supply Gap | 222 | $\begin{aligned} & 126100 \\ & 130100 \\ & 130560 \\ & 210400 \\ & 210440 \\ & 210450 \end{aligned}$ | Community Health Care Worker <br> Family and Consumer Sciences, General <br> Parenting and Family Education Human Services <br> Alcohol and Controlled Substances <br> Disability Services |
| 13-1023 | Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | 390 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 11-9021 | Construction Managers* | 374 | Oversupply | 689 | $\begin{aligned} & 050100 \\ & 095700 \end{aligned}$ | Business and Commerce, General Civil and Construction Management Technology |
| 53-3022 | Bus Drivers, School or Special Client | 358 | Supply Gap | N/A | 094750 | Truck and Bus Driving |
| 51-2022 | Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers | 357 | Supply Gap | 148 | $\begin{aligned} & 092400 \\ & 093400 \end{aligned}$ | Engineering Technology, General Electronics and Electric Technology |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics and Installers | 348 | Supply Gap | 323 | 094600 | Environmental Control Technology |
| 41-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Non-Retail Sales Workers | 341 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 13-1051 | Cost Estimators* | 341 | Oversupply | 438 | 050600 | Business Management |
| 11-3011 | Administrative Services Managers* | 339 | Oversupply | 1,885 | 050500 | Business Administration |
| 15-1199 | Computer Occupations, All Other | 326 | Oversupply | 456 | 061420 070100 070200 070600 070910 079900 220610 | Electronic Game Design Information Technology, General Computer Information Systems Computer Science (Transfer) E-Commerce (Technology Emphasis) Other Information Technology Geographic Information Systems |
| 11-9141 | Property, Real Estate, and Community Association Managers | 324 | Supply Gap | 54 | 051100 | Real Estate |
| 29-2052 | Pharmacy Technicians | 304 | Supply Gap | 176 | 122100 | Pharmacy Technology |
| 49-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers | 299 | Supply Gap | 62 | 093440 | Electrical Systems and Power Transmission |
| 43-6012 | Legal Secretaries | 296 | Supply Gap | 10 | 051410 | Legal Office Technology |
| 47-2211 | Sheet Metal Workers | 295 | Supply Gap | 36 | 095640 | Sheet Metal and Structural Metal |
| 35-1011 | Chefs and Head Cooks | 290 | Oversupply | 1,052 | $\begin{aligned} & 130600 \\ & 130630 \\ & 130710 \end{aligned}$ | Nutrition, Foods, and Culinary Arts Culinary Arts Restaurant and Food Services and Management |
| 39-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Personal Service Workers | 288 | Oversupply | 1,303 | 300700 | Cosmetology and Barbering |
| 13-1081 | Logisticians | 281 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 33-3012 | Correctional Officers and Jailers | 266 | Supply Gap | 51 | 210510 | Corrections |
| 13-2072 | Loan Officers | 264 | Supply Gap | 0 | 051110 | Escrow |
| 17-3023 | Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians | 260 | Supply Gap | 42 | $\begin{aligned} & 093410 \\ & 093430 \\ & 094300 \end{aligned}$ | Computer Electronics <br> Telecommunications Technology <br> Instrumentation Technology |
| 31-9099 | Healthcare Support Workers, All Other | 259 | Supply Gap | 10 | $\begin{aligned} & 120830 \\ & 122000 \end{aligned}$ | Health Facility Unit Coordinator Speech/Language Pathology and Audiology |
| 47-2073 | Operating Engineers and Other Construction Equipment Operators | 256 | Supply Gap | 0 | 094730 | Heavy Equipment Operation |
| 13-1031 | Claims Adjusters, Examiners, and Investigators | 255 | Supply Gap | 0 | 051200 | Insurance |
| 13-1151 | Training and Development Specialists | 252 | Supply Gap | N/A | 086000 | Educational Technology |
| 15-1142 | Network and Computer Systems Administrators | 251 | Oversupply | 303 | $\begin{aligned} & 070810 \\ & 093430 \end{aligned}$ | Computer Networking Telecommunications Technology |


| SOC | Occupational Title | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | Supply Gap or Oversupply | 2013-15 <br> Average Awards | TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 15-1134 | Web Developers | 239 | Supply Gap | 236 | $\begin{aligned} & 061430 \\ & 070700 \\ & 070710 \\ & 070900 \\ & 070910 \end{aligned}$ | Website Design and Development Computer Software Development Computer Programming World Wide Web Administration E-Commerce (Technology Emphasis) |
| 33-2011 | Firefighters | 237 | Oversupply | 292 | $\begin{aligned} & 213300 \\ & 213310 \\ & 213350 \end{aligned}$ | Fire Technology Wildland Fire Technology Fire Academy |
| 33-3021 | Detectives and Criminal Investigators | 228 | Supply Gap | 79 | 210540 | Forensics, Evidence, and Investigation |
| 29-2012 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technicians | 228 | Supply Gap | 43 | $\begin{aligned} & 093470 \\ & 095500 \\ & 120500 \end{aligned}$ | Electron Microscopy <br> Laboratory Science Technology <br> Medical Laboratory Technology |
| 29-2099 | Health Technologists and Technicians, All Other | 227 | Supply Gap | 27 | $\begin{aligned} & 121100 \\ & 121200 \\ & 121400 \end{aligned}$ | Polysomnography Electro-Neurodiagnostic Technology Orthopedic Assistant |
| 49-9041 | Industrial Machinery Mechanics | 227 | Supply Gap | 9 | 095600 | Manufacturing and Industrial Technology |
| 27-4021 | Photographers | 219 | Supply Gap | 200 | 050910 061400 100100 100200 101100 101200 | Advertising <br> Digital Media <br> Fine Arts, General <br> Art (Painting, Drawing, and Sculpture) <br> Photography <br> Applied Photography |
| 31-9097 | Phlebotomists | 211 | Supply Gap | 0 | 120510 | Phlebotomy |
| 29-2021 | Dental Hygienists | 205 | Supply Gap | 49 | 124020 | Dental Hygienist |
| 43-3051 | Payroll and Timekeeping Clerks | 201 | Oversupply | 557 | 050200 | Accounting |
| 49-3031 | Bus and Truck Mechanics and Diesel Engine Specialists | 200 | Supply Gap | 86 | 094700 | Diesel Technology |
| 43-4131 | Loan Interviewers and Clerks | 186 | Supply Gap | 18 | 050400 | Banking and Finance |
| 43-4161 | Human Resources Assistants, Except Payroll and Timekeeping | 182 | Supply Gap | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| 43-4181 | Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks | 180 | Supply Gap | 15 | 300900 | Travel Services and Tourism |
| 27-3091 | Interpreters and Translators | 179 | Supply Gap | 28 | $\begin{aligned} & 060700 \\ & 061000 \\ & 085010 \\ & 110100 \end{aligned}$ | Technical Communication <br> Mass Communications <br> Sign Language Interpreting <br> Foreign Languages, General |
| 29-2071 | Medical Records and Health Information Technicians | 178 | Supply Gap | 28 | 122300 | Health Information Technology |
| 49-3021 | Automotive Body and Related Repairers | 176 | Supply Gap | 48 | 094900 | Automotive Collision Repair |
| 37-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Landscaping, Lawn Service, and Groundskeeping Workers | 171 | Supply Gap | 147 | $\begin{aligned} & 010900 \\ & 010910 \\ & 010930 \\ & 010940 \\ & 011510 \end{aligned}$ | Horticulture <br> Landscape Design and Maintenance <br> Nursery Technology <br> Turfgrass Technology <br> Parks and Outdoor Recreation |
| 51-4011 | Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators, Metal and Plastic | 165 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 25-4031 | Library Technicians | 164 | Supply Gap | 22 | 160200 | Library Technician (Aide) |
| 47-4011 | Construction and Building Inspectors | 155 | Supply Gap | 31 | 095720 | Construction Inspection |
| 53-1031 | First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and MaterialMoving Machine and Vehicle Operators | 153 | Supply Gap | 2 | 094740 | Railroad and Light Rail Operations |
| 13-1022 | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products | 152 | Supply Gap | N/A | 050920 | Purchasing |
| 17-3029 | Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other | 150 | Supply Gap | 38 | $\begin{aligned} & 094610 \\ & 099900 \end{aligned}$ | Energy Systems Technology Other Engineering and Related Industrial Technologies |
| 17-3011 | Architectural and Civil Drafters | 146 | Supply Gap | 142 | $\begin{aligned} & 020100 \\ & 095300 \\ & 095310 \end{aligned}$ | Architecture and Architectural Technology <br> Drafting Technology <br> Architectural Drafting |


| SOC | Occupational Title | 2017-22 <br> Annual <br> Openings | Supply Gap or Oversupply | 2013-15 Average Awards | TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 15-1152 | Computer Network Support Specialists | 145 | Supply Gap | 0 | 070730 | Computer Systems Analysis |
| 11-3051 | Industrial Production Managers* | 144 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 53-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Helpers, Laborers, and Material Movers, Hand | 143 | Supply Gap | -- | ${ }^{--}$ | -- |
| 51-2011 | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers | 142 | Supply Gap | 92 | 095000 095010 095020 | Aeronautical and Aviation Technology Aviation Airframe Mechanics Aviation Powerplant Mechanics |
| 13-2082 | Tax Preparers | 141 | Oversupply | 570 | $\begin{aligned} & 050200 \\ & 050210 \end{aligned}$ | Accounting Tax Studies |
| 49-3011 | Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians | 137 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 29-2011 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technologists | 135 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 29-2034 | Radiologic Technologists | 129 | Supply Gap | 71 | 122500 | Radiologic Technology |
| 19-4099 | Life, Physical, and Social Science Technicians, All Other | 126 | Supply Gap | 60 | 043000 | Biotechnology and Biomedical Technology |
| 29-2056 | Veterinary Technologists and Technicians | 125 | Oversupply | 237 | 010210 | Veterinary Technician (Licensed) |
| 31-2021 | Physical Therapist Assistants | 122 | Supply Gap | 46 | 122200 | Physical Therapist Assistant |
| 43-5011 | Cargo and Freight Agents | 120 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 11-9081 | Lodging Managers | 113 | Supply Gap | 39 | $\begin{aligned} & 130700 \\ & 130720 \end{aligned}$ | Hospitality <br> Lodging Management |
| 51-8031 | Water and Wastewater Treatment Plant and System Operators | 104 | Supply Gap | 92 | 095800 | Water and Wastewater Technology |
| 47-2221 | Structural Iron and Steel Workers | 103 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 17-3022 | Civil Engineering Technicians | 102 | Supply Gap | 2 | 210210 | Public Works |
| 15-1143 | Computer Network Architects | 101 | Supply Gap | -- | -- | -- |
| 29-2055 | Surgical Technologists | 101 | Supply Gap | 55 | 121700 | Surgical Technician |
| 47-2121 | Glaziers | 99 | Supply Gap | N/A | 095240 | Glazing |
| 11-3071 | Transportation, Storage, and Distribution Managers* | 99 | Supply Gap | 22 | $\begin{aligned} & 210200 \\ & 302000 \\ & 302010 \end{aligned}$ | Public Administration <br> Aviation and Airport Management and Services <br> Aviation and Airport Management |
|  | Total Demand | 45,457 |  | 16,403 | Total Supply |  |

*TOP codes associated with these occupations include 050100 Business Commerce, General, 050500 Business Administration and 050600 Business Management. Comparing labor market demand for these occupations against program supply in these three TOP codes indicates that there is an oversupply of labor for all these occupations. However, it could be argued that business-related TOP codes do not train specifically for these occupations, so these supply numbers may be overestimated.

## Disclaimer about Supply Gap Analysis

Subtracting program awards (labor supply) from annual openings (labor demand) is a basic analysis of supply gaps in labor market research. The data should be used to discuss the potential gaps or oversupply of workers for these occupations; however, it should not be the only basis for determining whether or not a program should be developed. The data is incomplete; it does not include workers who are currently in the labor force who could fill these positions or program supply from educational institutions that do not publicly disclose their completion or outcomes data.

## Key Findings and Recommendations

The following findings resulted from analyzing labor market demand, program supply and supply gaps of the top middle-skill jobs in San Diego County:

- Training for the top middle-skill jobs can provide job seekers with opportunities for income mobility. As previously mentioned, the average median hourly wage of all middle-skill jobs is $\$ 22.10$, the average median hourly wage of all jobs in the region is $\$ 19.30$, and the Self-Sufficiency Standard is $\$ 13.09$. The average median hourly wage of the top 100 middle-skill jobs analyzed in this study is $\$ 26.70$, which is higher than all three (Figure 4).

Figure 4. Median Hourly Earnings vs Self-Sufficiency Standard


- Of the top 100 middle-skill jobs identified in this study, 88 have supply gaps and 12 have labor surpluses. Comparatively, the top 100 above-middle-skill jobs have only 30 supply gaps, suggesting that middle-skill jobs have more opportunities to develop programs than above-middle-skill jobs (Figure 5).

Figure 5. Analysis of Middle-Skill Job Gaps


- The top 100 middle-skill jobs have a labor market demand of 45,457 annual job openings a program supply of 16,403 awards. That is a difference of 29,044 awards that could be produced by the region to meet labor market demand. Across the top 100 middle-skill jobs, the median supply gap is 260 awards.
- Not all middle-skill jobs need to be filled with an associate degree. Of the 45,457 annual job openings, 16 percent of labor market demand are related to supervisorial or management roles, 17 percent are related to sales roles, and 17 percent are related to administrative or secretarial roles (Figure 6). The majority of these occupations require less than an associate degree as their typical entry-level education. This suggests that there are opportunities for short-term certificate programs that can fill these roles. Short-term certificate programs require less than two years to complete.

Figure 6. Percentage of Top Middle-Skill Jobs with Management, Sales or Administrative Titles*

*These percentages have some overlap because an occupation may have more than one role: For example, First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers are both supervisorial and administrative positions.

- As indicated in Table 2, nearly all top middle-skill jobs are also a top job in one or more of the Priority and Emerging Sectors. By closing the supply gaps in the top middle-skill jobs, educational and training providers are also generating new jobs in the Priority and Emerging Sectors. Figure 7 illustrates how many total jobs will be added to the region as a result of a new job added to a Priority and Emerging Sector. ${ }^{14} \mathrm{~A}$ jobs multiplier includes the initial job addition and its resulting yield. For example, Business and Entrepreneurship's jobs multiplier is 6.95 , which is comprised of the initial job added (1.0) and the additional yield (5.95). In other words, a new job added in the Business and Entrepreneurship sector generates 5.95 other jobs in the region.

Figure 7. Jobs Multipliers by Priority and Emerging Sector


[^5]
## Recommendations for Short-Term Certificate Programs

Comparing labor market demand with program supply suggests that there are 88 supply gaps for the top 100 middleskill jobs. As previously mentioned, some of these supply gaps could be filled with short-term certificate programs due to their training and education requirements. A short-term certificate program can be a program with an award of at least one but less than two academic years, or a program with an award of less than one academic year.

Programs (TOP6 codes) with the following characteristics are recommended for short-term certificate programs:

- There is a supply gap of 100 or more for the occupation(s) that the program trains for; and
- The majority of middle-skill jobs that the program (TOP6) trains for require short- to moderate-term on-the-job training and/or a high school diploma; and
- The program trains for three or more top middle-skill jobs; or
- There are fewer than five colleges that offer the program in the region and there are fewer than four other TOP6 codes that train for the same occupation.

The following tables list the TOP6 codes recommended for short-term certificate programs based on the California Community Colleges' Priority and Emerging Sectors. The TOP codes for each sector were derived by from CaIPASS Plus's "LaunchBoard Sector Explanation." 15 Some TOP codes are associated with more than one sector and are shown more than once in the tables below.

## Disclaimer about Recommendations for Short-Term Certificate Programs

While this study makes recommendations for short-term programs based on specific parameters, this information should not be the only basis for developing short-term certificate programs. There are many factors to consider before developing a new program. For example, the TOP6 codes recommended in the Advanced Transportation and Logistics sector require significant investments in space and equipment (e.g., vehicles), and colleges in the region may not have the capacity or resources to meet those needs.

Additionally, some short-term certificate programs may be more suited for current working professionals (also known as incumbent workers) than for new graduates entering the labor force. For example, TOP6 050630 Management Development and Supervision presumably trains individuals for management positions after they have acquired prior training and experience. Short-term certificate programs can help incumbent workers upskill their knowledge base in a particular field. Incumbent workers who take courses to learn new skills are also known as "skills-builders" in the community college system. See Recommendations for Further Analysis, which further elaborates on developing short-term programs for skills-builders.

[^6]Table 3. TOP6 Codes Recommended for Short-Term Certificate Programs

## Business and Entrepreneurship

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050630 | Management Development and Supervision | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 28.00 \\ & \$ 31.47 \\ & \$ 36.15 \\ & \$ 39.63 \\ & \$ 40.86 \\ & \$ 46.10 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers <br> Construction Managers <br> Administrative Services Managers <br> Logisticians <br> Industrial Production Managers | - Southwestern |
| 050900 | Marketing and Distribution | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \\ & \$ 33.82 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products <br> Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | - National University <br> - Grossmont <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |
| 050940 | Sales and Salesmanship | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.52 \\ & \$ 24.10 \\ & \$ 25.20 \end{aligned}$ | Customer Service Representatives <br> Sales Representatives, Services, All Other <br> Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | - Palomar <br> - San Diego City |
| 050970 | E-Commerce (Business Emphasis) | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.77 \\ & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 35.66 \end{aligned}$ | Business Operations Specialists, All Other First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers | - Southwestern |
| 050920 | Purchasing | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 39.63 \\ & \$ 33.82 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Administrative Services Managers Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | - None |

## ICT and Digital Media

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 051400 | Office <br> Technology/Office Computer Applications | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 18.42 \\ & \$ 21.42 \\ & \$ 28.25 \end{aligned}$ | Secretaries and Administrative Assistants, Except Legal, Medical, and Executive <br> Cargo and Freight Agents <br> Executive Secretaries and Executive Administrative Assistants | - San Diego College <br> - San Diego Continuing Ed <br> - Cuyamaca <br> - Grossmont <br> - MiraCosta <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern <br> - United Education Institute (UEI)-Chula Vista <br> - UEI-San Marcos |
| 070910 | E-Commerce <br> (Technology Emphasis) | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.77 \\ & \$ 21.55 \\ & \$ 27.05 \\ & \$ 41.93 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers Web Developers <br> Computer User Support Specialists <br> Computer Occupations, All Other | - MiraCosta <br> - Southwestern |

## Advanced Transportation and Logistics

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 051000 | Logistics and Materials Transportation | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.42 \\ & \$ 21.50 \\ & \$ 22.18 \\ & \$ 26.64 \\ & \\ & \$ 31.29 \\ & \$ 40.86 \\ & \$ 46.10 \end{aligned}$ | Cargo and Freight Agents <br> First-Line Supervisors of Helpers, Laborers, and <br> Material Movers, Hand <br> Production, Planning, and Expediting Clerks <br> First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and Material- <br> Moving Machine and Vehicle Operators <br> Logisticians <br> Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other Industrial Production Managers | - Southwestern |
| 094740 | Railroad and Light Rail Operations | \$26.64 | First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and MaterialMoving Machine and Vehicle Operators | - San Diego City |

## Life Sciences and Biotech

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the <br> Program |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 095680 | Industrial Quality <br> Control | $\$ 19.62$ | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers | • San Diego City |

## Global Trade

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050800 | International Business and Trade | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \\ & \$ 35.66 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products <br> Business Operations Specialists, All Other | - Grossmont <br> - Palomar <br> - Southwestern |
| 050920 | Purchasing | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 33.82 \\ & \$ 39.63 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products <br> Administrative Services Managers | - None |

## Health Care

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the <br> Program |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 120820 | Administrative Medical <br> Assisting | $\$ 18.99$ | Medical Secretaries | - MiraCosta <br> $\bullet$ Palomar <br> • Southwestern |

## Other

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the <br> Program |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 051200 | Insurance | $\$ 23.01$ <br> $\$ 30.84$ | Insurance Sales Agents <br> Claims Adjusters, Examiners, and Investigators | - Southwestern |
| 051410 | Legal Office Technology | $\$ 22.53$ | Legal Secretaries | - San Diego City |

## Tourism

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050630 | Management Development and Supervision | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 28.00 \\ & \$ 31.47 \\ & \$ 36.15 \\ & \$ 39.63 \\ & \$ 40.86 \\ & \$ 46.10 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers <br> Construction Managers <br> Administrative Services Managers <br> Logisticians <br> Industrial Production Managers | - Southwestern |
| 050900 | Marketing and Distribution | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \\ & \$ 33.82 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products <br> Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | - National University <br> - Grossmont <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |
| 050940 | Sales and Salesmanship | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.52 \\ & \$ 24.10 \\ & \$ 25.20 \end{aligned}$ | Customer Service Representatives <br> Sales Representatives, Services, All Other <br> Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | - Palomar <br> - San Diego City |
| 051440 | Office Management | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 39.63 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> Administrative Services Managers | - None |
| 130320 | Fashion Merchandising | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | - Fashion Institute of Design \& Merchandising-San Diego <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Argosy University-The Art Institute of California-San Diego |
| 300900 | Travel Services and Tourism | \$18.46 | Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks | - MiraCosta <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |

## Programs Recommended for Increased Awards

The supply gap analysis indicates that there are several TOP codes with existing training programs already in the region but could be further developed to meet labor market demand. Programs with the following characteristics are recommended for increased awards

- There is a supply gap of 100 or more for the occupation(s) that the program trains for; and
- There are fewer than four other TOP6 codes that train for the same occupation(s).

The following tables list the recommended programs for increased awards. The TOP codes associated with each sector were derived from CaIPASS Plus's "LaunchBoard Sector Explanation." 16 Some TOP codes are associated with more than one sector and are shown more than once in the tables below.

## Disclaimer about Recommendations for Increased Awards

While this study makes recommendations for increased awards, this study should not be the only basis for growing existing programs. There are many factors to consider before expanding current programs. For example, some of the Health Care TOP6 codes require clinical placement at Health Care organizations for students to complete the programs, but the region may not have the capacity to meet those needs. Similarly, other programs may be at capacity due to limitations in space and resources and cannot expand.

Table 4. Programs Recommended for Increased Awards

## Life Sciences

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 043000 | Biotechnology and Biomedical Technology | \$22.99 | Life, Physical, and Social Science Technicians, All Other | - MiraCosta <br> - San Diego City <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |
| 095500 | Laboratory Science Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 19.62 \\ & \$ 21.24 \end{aligned}$ | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technicians | - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |
| 095680 | Industrial Quality Control | \$19.62 | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers | - San Diego City |

Global Trade

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the <br> Program |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 050800 | International Business <br> and Trade | $\$ 23.42$ <br> $\$ 25.20$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products <br> Sales Representatives, Wholesale and <br> Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific <br> Products | - Grossmont <br> - Palomar <br> - Southwestern |

[^7]
## Energy, Construction and Utilities

$\left.\left.\begin{array}{|l|l|l|l|l|l|}\hline \text { TOP6 } & \text { TOP6 Program Title } & \begin{array}{l}\text { Median } \\ \text { Hourly } \\ \text { Earnings }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { Colleges Offering the } \\ \text { Program }\end{array} \\ \hline 020100 & \begin{array}{l}\text { Architecture and } \\ \text { Architectural Technology }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\$ 27.71 \\ \$ 31.29\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { Architectural and Civil Drafters } \\ \text { Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other }\end{array} & \begin{array}{l}\text { - Southwestern } \\ \text { - MiraCosta } \\ \text { - Palomar }\end{array} \\ \text { - San Diego Mesa }\end{array}\right] \begin{array}{l}\text { - Southwestern }\end{array}\right]$ - San Diego City

## Advanced Transportation and Logistics

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 051000 | Logistics and Materials Transportation | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.42 \\ & \$ 21.50 \\ & \\ & \$ 22.18 \\ & \$ 26.64 \\ & \$ 31.29 \\ & \$ 40.86 \\ & \$ 46.10 \end{aligned}$ | Cargo and Freight Agents <br> First-Line Supervisors of Helpers, Laborers, and <br> Material Movers, Hand <br> Production, Planning, and Expediting Clerks <br> First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and Material- <br> Moving Machine and Vehicle Operators <br> Logisticians <br> Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other Industrial Production Managers | - Southwestern |
| 094700 | Diesel Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.25 \\ & \$ 28.12 \end{aligned}$ | Bus and Truck Mechanics and Diesel Engine Specialists <br> Operating Engineers and Other Construction Equipment Operators | - Palomar <br> - San Diego Miramar |
| 094740 | Railroad and Light Rail Operations | \$26.64 | First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and MaterialMoving Machine and Vehicle Operators | - San Diego City |
| 094900 | Automotive Collision Repair | \$17.38 | Automotive Body and Related Repairers | - San Diego Adult <br> - Palomar |

## Business and Entrepreneurship

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050630 | Management Development and Supervision | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 28.00 \\ & \$ 31.47 \\ & \$ 36.15 \\ & \$ 39.63 \\ & \$ 40.86 \\ & \$ 46.10 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers <br> Construction Managers <br> Administrative Services Managers <br> Logisticians <br> Industrial Production Managers | - Southwestern |
| 050640 | Small Business and Entrepreneurship | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 35.66 \\ & \$ 39.63 \end{aligned}$ | Business Operations Specialists, All Administrative Services Managers | - San Diego Continuing Ed <br> - Cuyamaca <br> - MiraCosta <br> - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern |
| 050900 | Marketing and Distribution | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \\ & \$ 33.82 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products <br> Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | - National University <br> - Grossmont <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |
| 050940 | Sales and Salesmanship | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.52 \\ & \$ 24.10 \\ & \$ 25.20 \end{aligned}$ | Customer Service Representatives <br> Sales Representatives, Services, All Other <br> Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | - Palomar <br> - San Diego City |
| 050970 | E-Commerce (Business Emphasis) | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.77 \\ & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 35.66 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> Business Operations Specialists, All Other | - Southwestern |
| 050920 | Purchasing | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 33.82 \\ & \$ 39.63 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products <br> Administrative Services Managers | - None |

## Tourism

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050630 | Management Development and Supervision | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 26.37 \\ & \$ 28.00 \\ & \$ 31.47 \\ & \$ 36.15 \\ & \$ 39.63 \\ & \$ 40.86 \\ & \$ 46.10 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers <br> First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers <br> Construction Managers <br> Administrative Services Managers <br> Logisticians <br> Industrial Production Managers | - Southwestern |
| 050650 | Retail Store Operations and Management | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.77 \\ & \$ 23.42 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products | - Grossmont <br> - MiraCosta <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego City |
| 050900 | Marketing and Distribution | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \\ & \$ 33.82 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products <br> Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | - National University <br> - Grossmont <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |


| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050940 | Sales and Salesmanship | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.52 \\ & \$ 24.10 \\ & \$ 25.20 \end{aligned}$ | Customer Service Representatives <br> Sales Representatives, Services, All Other <br> Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | - Palomar <br> - San Diego City |
| 051440 | Office Management | \$26.37 | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers <br> Administrative Services Managers | - None |
| 130320 | Fashion Merchandising | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.42 \\ & \$ 25.20 \end{aligned}$ | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | - Fashion Institute of Design \& Merchandising-San Diego <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Argosy University-The Art Institute of California-San Diego |
| 300900 | Travel Services and Tourism | \$18.46 | Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks | - MiraCosta <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - Southwestern |

## Advanced Manufacturing

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 093470 | Electronics and Electric Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.33 \\ & \$ 22.99 \\ & \$ 30.78 \end{aligned}$ | Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers Life, Physical, and Social Science Technicians, All Other <br> Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians | - San Diego Continuing Ed <br> - San Diego City |
| 095000 | Aeronautical and Aviation Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.73 \\ & \$ 29.87 \end{aligned}$ | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers <br> Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians | - San Diego Miramar |
| 095010 | Aviation Airframe Mechanics | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.73 \\ & \$ 29.87 \end{aligned}$ | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers <br> Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians | - San Diego Miramar |
| 095020 | Aviation Powerplant Mechanics | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.73 \\ & \$ 29.87 \end{aligned}$ | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers <br> Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians | - San Diego Miramar |
| 095600 | Manufacturing and Industrial Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 19.62 \\ & \$ 20.65 \\ & \$ 23.72 \\ & \$ 26.80 \\ & \$ 30.48 \\ & \$ 31.29 \end{aligned}$ | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators, Metal and Plastic <br> Machinists <br> Industrial Machinery Mechanics <br> Structural Iron and Steel Workers <br> Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other | - San Diego Continuing Ed <br> - San Diego City |
| 095630 | Machining and Machine Tools | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 20.65 \\ & \$ 23.72 \end{aligned}$ | Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators, Metal and Plastic <br> Machinists | - MiraCosta <br> - San Diego City |
| 095640 | Sheet Metal and Structural Metal | \$27.19 | Sheet Metal Workers | - San Diego Adult <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego City |
| 210210 | Public Works | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 27.88 \\ & \$ 34.36 \end{aligned}$ | Civil Engineering Technicians <br> First-Line Supervisors of Construction Trades and Extraction Workers | - Palomar |

## Health Care

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 120310 | Registered Nursing | \$43.63 | Registered Nurses | - National University <br> - United States University <br> - San Diego State University <br> - California State University-San Marcos <br> - Point Loma Nazarene University <br> - Grossmont <br> - MiraCosta <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern <br> - Brightwood College-San Diego |
| 120500 | Medical Laboratory Technology | \$21.24 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technicians | - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |
| 120820 | Administrative Medical Assisting | \$18.99 | Medical Secretaries | - MiraCosta <br> - Palomar <br> - Southwestern |
| 121400 | Orthopedic Assistant | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 20.86 \\ & \$ 32.56 \\ & \$ 37.04 \end{aligned}$ | Health Technologists and Technicians, All Other <br> Physical Therapist Assistants <br> Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technologists | - Grossmont |
| 122000 | Speech/Language Pathology and Audiology | \$20.06 | Healthcare Support Workers, All Other | - Grossmont |
| 122100 | Pharmacy Technology | \$17.01 | Pharmacy Technicians | - Pima Medical InstituteChula Vista <br> - United Education Institute-San Marcos <br> - Brightwood CollegeVista |
| 122300 | Health Information Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.40 \\ & \$ 27.05 \end{aligned}$ | Medical Records and Health Information Technicians Computer User Support Specialists | - National University <br> - San Diego Mesa |
| 122310 | Health Information Coding | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 18.99 \\ & \$ 21.40 \end{aligned}$ | Medical Secretaries <br> Medical Records and Health Information Technicians | - San Diego College <br> - Concorde Career College-San Diego <br> - Southwestern <br> - Brightwood CollegeChula Vista <br> - Brightwood College-San Diego <br> - Brightwood CollegeVista |
| 123020 | Licensed Vocational Nursing | \$25.99 | Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses | - Concorde Career College-San Diego <br> - MiraCosta <br> - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern <br> - United Education Institute-Chula Vista <br> - Brightwood College-San Diego <br> - Brightwood CollegeVista |


| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 124010 | Dental Assistant | \$19.69 | Dental Assistants | - Pima Medical InstituteChula Vista <br> - Concorde Career College-San Diego <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - United Education Institute-Chula Vista <br> - United Education Institute-UEI College San Marcos <br> - Brightwood College-San Diego <br> - Brightwood CollegeVista |
| 124020 | Dental Hygienist | \$44.09 | Dental Hygienists | - Southwestern <br> - Concorde Career College-San Diego |

## ICT and Digital Media

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 070100 | Information Technology, General | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 30.78 \\ & \$ 39.31 \\ & \$ 41.93 \\ & \$ 50.71 \end{aligned}$ | Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians Network and Computer Systems Administrators Computer Occupations, All Other Computer Network Architects | - Associated Technical College-San Diego <br> - Advanced Training Associates <br> - Cuyamaca <br> - Southwestern |
| 070200 | Computer Information Systems | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 27.05 \\ & \$ 30.78 \\ & \$ 39.31 \\ & \$ 41.93 \\ & \$ 50.71 \end{aligned}$ | Computer User Support Specialists Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians Network and Computer Systems Administrators Computer Occupations, All Other Computer Network Architects | - MiraCosta <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego City <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |
| 070600 | Computer Science (Transfer) | \$21.55 $\$ 41.93$ $\$ 31.24$ | Web Developers <br> Computer Occupations, All Other <br> Computer Network Support Specialists | - MiraCosta <br> - Southwestern |
| 070700 | Computer Software Development | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 21.55 \\ & \$ 31.24 \\ & \$ 41.93 \end{aligned}$ | Web Developers <br> Computer Network Support Specialists <br> Computer Occupations, All Other | - Palomar |
| 070800 | Computer Infrastructure and Support | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 27.05 \\ & \$ 31.24 \\ & \$ 39.31 \\ & \$ 41.93 \\ & \$ 50.71 \end{aligned}$ | Computer User Support Specialists <br> Computer Network Support Specialists <br> Network and Computer Systems Administrators <br> Computer Occupations, All Other <br> Computer Network Architects | - Coleman University <br> - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern |
| 070820 | Computer Support | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 27.05 \\ & \$ 31.24 \\ & \$ 39.31 \\ & \$ 41.93 \\ & \$ 50.71 \end{aligned}$ | Computer User Support Specialists <br> Computer Network Support Specialists <br> Network and Computer Systems Administrators <br> Computer Occupations, All Other <br> Computer Network Architects | - San Diego Adult <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern |
| 093430 | Telecommunications Technology | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 30.78 \\ & \$ 39.31 \end{aligned}$ | Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians Network and Computer Systems Administrators | - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern |


| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 051400 | Office <br> Technology/Office Computer Applications | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 18.42 \\ & \$ 21.42 \\ & \$ 28.25 \end{aligned}$ | Secretaries and Administrative Assistants, Except Legal, Medical, and Executive <br> Cargo and Freight Agents <br> Executive Secretaries and Executive Administrative Assistants | - San Diego College <br> - San Diego Continuing Ed <br> - Cuyamaca <br> - Grossmont <br> - MiraCosta <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Mesa <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern <br> - United Education Institute (UEI)-Chula Vista <br> - UEl-San Marcos |
| 070910 | E-Commerce <br> (Technology Emphasis) | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 17.77 \\ & \$ 21.55 \\ & \$ 27.05 \\ & \$ 41.93 \end{aligned}$ | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers Web Developers <br> Computer User Support Specialists Computer Occupations, All Other | - MiraCosta <br> - Southwestern |

## Other

| TOP6 | TOP6 Program Title | Median Hourly Earnings | Related Top Middle-Skill Jobs | Colleges Offering the Program |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 050400 | Banking and Finance | \$20.78 | Loan Interviewers and Clerks | - National University <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |
| 051200 | Insurance | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 23.01 \\ & \$ 30.84 \end{aligned}$ | Insurance Sales Agents Claims Adjusters, Examiners, and Investigators | - Southwestern |
| 051410 | Legal Office Technology | \$22.53 | Legal Secretaries | - San Diego City <br> - Southwestern |
| 085010 | Sign Language Interpreting | \$24.10 | Interpreters and Translators | - Palomar <br> - San Diego Mesa |
| 086000 | Educational Technology | \$33.96 | Training and Development Specialists | - None |
| 160200 | Library Technician (Aide) | \$20.85 | Library Technicians | - Palomar |
| 210510 | Corrections | \$33.83 | Correctional Officers and Jailers | - Grossmont <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |
| 210540 | Forensics, Evidence, and Investigation | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 39.41 \\ & \$ 42.20 \end{aligned}$ | Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers Detectives and Criminal Investigators | - Grossmont <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |
| 210550 | Police Academy | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 39.41 \\ & \$ 42.20 \end{aligned}$ | Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers Detectives and Criminal Investigators | - Grossmont <br> - Palomar <br> - San Diego Miramar <br> - Southwestern |

## Recommendations for Further Analysis

The following recommendations for further research could be coupled with this labor market analysis to help with decision-making in regard to programs and course offerings:

- Validate whether the recommended TOP codes for short-term certificate programs currently train skills-builders: Many of the TOP codes that this study recommends for short-term certificate programs may already train for skills-builders in the region. Skills-builders are students who take higher-level Career Education courses, but do not complete a community college program or transfer to a four-year institution. ${ }^{17}$ These skills-builders may take a college course to obtain new skills and/or to increase their earnings, but do not need to complete an associate degree program to achieve those goals. By understanding what programs train skills-builders, colleges in the region may want to consider which courses, rather than programs, to market to students and working professionals.
- Examine how well existing programs currently meet labor market needs: While this study makes recommendations for program development based on labor market information, it lacks information about the programs themselves. By conducting a program evaluation, the community colleges can gain insight as to why so many programs exist in the region for the top 100 middle-skill jobs, but supply from each program is significantly low. This analysis should be followed by recommendations on how the colleges could increase program supply for those recommended TOP codes.
- Conduct primary research to validate these recommendations with employers: This study provides lists of recommended TOP codes for short-term certificate and associate degree programs. However, the recommendations have not been validated by industry or businesses. Collecting primary data directly from employers will help further confirm program recommendations.
- Analyze other occupations that might be affected by technology, policy, demographics, or other changes: This study examines the top 100 middle-skill jobs by labor market demand in the region; however, training and educational providers in the region may also want to keep a pulse on occupations that will be affected by factors other than labor market demand. One factor to consider is that not all jobs are filled by workers who reside in the region. In comparing the number of jobs with the number of resident workers, there are thousands of occupations filled by people commuting into the region. Figures 8 and 9 list the top 10 middle-skill jobs that are filled by commuters and the top 10 middle-skill jobs that residents commute out of the region to fill. For example, employers in the region reported employing 24,587 Registered Nurses and 23,890 residents in the region reported to be employed as Registered Nurses in 2017. The difference between the number of jobs and resident workers suggests that there are 697 workers who commute into the region to fill the employment need for that occupation (Figure 8). ${ }^{18}$ Comparatively, there are 10,281 jobs and 10,824 resident workers for the occupation, Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products. The difference between the number of jobs and the number of resident workers suggests that 543 San Diegans commute out or telecommute for these positions outside of the region (Figure 9). ${ }^{19}$

[^8]Figure 8. Top 10 Middle-Skill Jobs Filled by Commuters into the Region, San Diego 2017


Figure 9. Top 10 Middle-Skill Jobs with Residents Commuting Out the Region, San Diego 2017


## Appendix A: Data Definitions

SOC Code and Occupational Title: The Standard Occupational Classification System (SOC) is a statistical standard used by federal agencies to classify workers into occupational categories for the purpose of collecting, calculating, or disseminating data. All workers are classified into one of the 867 SOC codes and their occupational titles.

Annual (Job) Openings are the estimated employment change and turnover for an occupation each year between 2017 and 2022. This number is used to determine labor market demand. Annual openings combine two types of data sets:

- Job Growth: An employer experiences greater demand for its products and hires new employees to increase production. If job growth is zero or negative, then any and all openings are due to replacement needs.
- Replacement Needs: An employer hires replacement workers for employees who leave the workforce or change occupations. Replacement rates are derived from national 10-year, occupation-specific percentages published by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) Employment Projections program. Annual openings data includes the new BLS "separations" methodology in its calculation of replacement needs job opportunities.

Number of Jobs in 2017 indicates the total number of people employed in that occupation as of 2017.
$2017-2022 \%$ Jobs Change is the percentage change from 2017 to 2022 , using number of jobs in 2017 as the baseline.

Entry-Level Hourly Earnings are the hourly earnings made by the 25 th percentile of current workers within an occupation. The self-sufficient wage for San Diego County is $\$ 13.09$ per hour. Only occupations that allow entry-level workers to earn the self-sufficient wage or higher were included in the top 100 jobs list.

Median Hourly Earnings are the wages per hour, excluding benefits, of a worker in an occupation. Median hourly earnings are in the middle of the wage distribution for an occupation: Half of the workers make more, half make less.

Typical Entry-Level Education + On-the-Job Training (OJT) + Work Experience (Exp.) represents the educational attainment and training most often needed to enter the occupation. Typical entry-level education can be a high school diploma, associate degree, bachelor's degree, etc. Work experience can range from less than five years to more than five years. On-the-job training needed to attain skills competency for an occupation has three levels:

- Long-term OJT: More than 12 months
- Moderate-term OJT: More than 1 month and up to 12 months
- Short-term OJT: One month or less

Priority and Emerging Sector Top Job indicates that the top middle-skill job is also one of the top 100 jobs in the listed Priority and Emerging Sector.

3-Year Average Supply is the three-year average of awards for a specific TOP6 code between PY13-14 and PY1516.

TOP6 and TOP6 Program Title illustrate which programs train for a specific occupational code (SOC). The TOP6 codes were selected based on the COE's TOP-SOC crosswalk.

## Appendix B: Demand, Supply and Gaps - Definitions and Methodology

## Middle-Skill and Above-Middle-Skill Jobs

In order to analyze employment trends, the Centers of Excellence for Labor Market Research (COE) ${ }^{20}$ across the state of California examined 867 occupational codes from the Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) ${ }^{21}$ system and classified 298 occupations as "middle-skill jobs" and 204 occupations as "above-middle-skill jobs." According to the COE, middle-skill jobs have the following training and education requirements:

- Some college coursework, a postsecondary certificate, and/or an associate degree; or
- High school diploma or equivalent with on-the-job training greater than 12 months; or
- Apprenticeship; or
- Bachelor's degree if at least 33 percent of workers in the occupation, age 25 or higher, have completed, as their highest level of education, some college coursework or an associate degree.

Of the 298 middle-skill jobs, the top 100 jobs were defined by the following parameters:

- Highest number of annual openings between 2017 and 2022;
- Entry-level hourly earnings ( $25^{\text {th }}$ percentile) greater than or equal to \$13.09; and
- No employment decline between 2017 and 2022.

Similarly, the top 100 above-middle-skill jobs were defined by the following parameters:

- Educational attainment of a bachelor's degree or higher (excluding those in the middle-skill jobs list above)
- Highest number of annual openings between 2017 and 2022;
- Entry-level hourly earnings ( $25^{\text {th }}$ percentile) greater than or equal to $\$ 13.09$; and
- No employment decline between 2017 and 2022.

The tables in the following pages list the top 100 middle-skill and above-middle-skill jobs based on the aforementioned parameters, sorted in alphabetical order. Occupational titles with an asterisk (*) have an oversupply of labor. The remaining occupations have supply gaps.

## Defining Top Priority Sector Jobs

To find the top jobs in Priority and Emerging Sectors, the COE first defined each sector by NAICS codes. After defining the industry sectors, the COE conducted a staffing patterns analysis. According to the California Employment Development Department, "Staffing patterns are a list of the occupations employed within a particular industry, or a list of the industries that employ a particular occupation." Because they are different than traditionally defined industry sectors, ICT \& Digital Media, Business \& Entrepreneurship, and Global Trade cannot be defined by NAICS alone. These professions are employed across multiple sectors; therefore, SOC codes are also used to define these three sectors. In addition to being a top job in the staffing patterns analysis, if a top middle-skill job also overlapped with an SOC code that defines one of these three sectors, then that middle-skill job was also considered a "top priority sector job" in ICT \& Digital Media, Business \& Entrepreneurship, and/or Global Trade.

[^9]| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 11-3011 | Administrative Services Managers* |
| 49-3011 | Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians |
| 51-2011 | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers |
| 17-3011 | Architectural and Civil Drafters |
| 49-3021 | Automotive Body and Related Repairers |
| 49-3031 | Bus and Truck Mechanics and Diesel Engine Specialists |
| 53-3022 | Bus Drivers, School or Special Client |
| 13-1199 | Business Operations Specialists, All Other |
| 43-5011 | Cargo and Freight Agents |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters |
| 35-1011 | Chefs and Head Cooks* |
| 17-3022 | Civil Engineering Technicians |
| 13-1031 | Claims Adjusters, Examiners, and Investigators |
| 15-1143 | Computer Network Architects |
| 15-1152 | Computer Network Support Specialists |
| 15-1199 | Computer Occupations, All Other* |
| 15-1151 | Computer User Support Specialists |
| 51-4011 | Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators, Metal and Plastic |
| 47-4011 | Construction and Building Inspectors |
| 11-9021 | Construction Managers* |
| 33-3012 | Correctional Officers and Jailers |
| 13-1051 | Cost Estimators* |
| 43-4051 | Customer Service Representatives |
| 31-9091 | Dental Assistants |
| 29-2021 | Dental Hygienists |
| 33-3021 | Detectives and Criminal Investigators |
| 51-2022 | Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers |
| 17-3023 | Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians |
| 47-2111 | Electricians |
| 17-3029 | Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other |
| 43-6011 | Executive Secretaries and Executive Administrative Assistants |
| 33-2011 | Firefighters* |
| 47-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Construction Trades and Extraction Workers |
| 53-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Helpers, Laborers, and Material Movers, Hand |
| 37-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Landscaping, Lawn Service, and Groundskeeping Workers |
| 49-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers |
| 41-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Non-Retail Sales Workers |
| 43-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers |
| 39-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Personal Service Workers* |
| 51-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers |
| 41-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers |
| 53-1031 | First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and MaterialMoving Machine and Vehicle Operators |
| 39-9031 | Fitness Trainers and Aerobics Instructors |
| 47-2121 | Glaziers |
| 29-2099 | Health Technologists and Technicians, All Other |
| 31-9099 | Healthcare Support Workers, All Other |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics and Installers |
| 53-3032 | Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers |
| 43-4161 | Human Resources Assistants, Except Payroll and Timekeeping |
| 49-9041 | Industrial Machinery Mechanics |


| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 11-3051 | Industrial Production Managers |
| 51-9061 | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers |
| 41-3021 | Insurance Sales Agents |
| 27-3091 | Interpreters and Translators |
| 43-6012 | Legal Secretaries |
| 25-4031 | Library Technicians |
| 29-2061 | Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses |
| 19-4099 | Life, Physical, and Social Science Technicians, All Other |
| 43-4131 | Loan Interviewers and Clerks |
| 13-2072 | Loan Officers |
| 11-9081 | Lodging Managers |
| 13-1081 | Logisticians |
| 51-4041 | Machinists |
| 49-9071 | Maintenance and Repair Workers, General |
| 29-2012 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technicians |
| 29-2011 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technologists |
| 31-9092 | Medical Assistants* |
| 29-2071 | Medical Records and Health Information Technicians |
| 43-6013 | Medical Secretaries |
| 15-1142 | Network and Computer Systems Administrators* |
| 47-2073 | Operating Engineers and Other Construction Equipment Operators |
| 23-2011 | Paralegals and Legal Assistants |
| 43-3051 | Payroll and Timekeeping Clerks* |
| 29-2052 | Pharmacy Technicians |
| 31-9097 | Phlebotomists |
| 27-4021 | Photographers |
| 31-2021 | Physical Therapist Assistants |
| 47-2152 | Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters |
| 33-3051 | Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers |
| 43-5061 | Production, Planning, and Expediting Clerks |
| 11-9141 | Property, Real Estate, and Community Association Managers |
| 13-1023 | Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products |
| 29-2034 | Radiologic Technologists |
| 29-1141 | Registered Nurses |
| 43-4181 | Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks |
| 41-3099 | Sales Representatives, Services, All Other |
| 41-4012 | Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products |
| 43-6014 | Secretaries and Administrative Assistants, Except Legal, Medical, and Executive |
| 47-2211 | Sheet Metal Workers |
| 21-1093 | Social and Human Service Assistants |
| 47-2221 | Structural Iron and Steel Workers |
| 29-2055 | Surgical Technologists |
| 13-2082 | Tax Preparers* |
| 13-1151 | Training and Development Specialists |
| 11-3071 | Transportation, Storage, and Distribution Managers |
| 29-2056 | Veterinary Technologists and Technicians* |
| 51-8031 | Water and Wastewater Treatment Plant and System Operators |
| 15-1134 | Web Developers |
| 51-4121 | Welders, Cutters, Solderers, and Brazers |
| 13-1022 | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products |


| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 13-2011 | Accountants and Auditors |
| 25-3011 | Adult Basic and Secondary Education and Literacy Teachers and Instructors* |
| 17-2011 | Aerospace Engineers |
| 17-1011 | Architects, Except Landscape and Naval |
| 11-9041 | Architectural and Engineering Managers* |
| 27-1011 | Art Directors* |
| 19-1021 | Biochemists and Biophysicists* |
| 19-1029 | Biological Scientists, All Other* |
| 19-4021 | Biological Technicians |
| 17-2031 | Biomedical Engineers* |
| 13-2031 | Budget Analysts* |
| 19-2031 | Chemists* |
| 11-1011 | Chief Executives* |
| 21-1021 | Child, Family, and School Social Workers* |
| 17-2051 | Civil Engineers |
| 19-3031 | Clinical, Counseling, and School Psychologists* |
| 27-2022 | Coaches and Scouts* |
| 21-1099 | Community and Social Service Specialists, All Other* |
| 13-1041 | Compliance Officers |
| 15-1111 | Computer and Information Research Scientists* |
| 11-3021 | Computer and Information Systems Managers* |
| 17-2061 | Computer Hardware Engineers* |
| 15-1121 | Computer Systems Analysts |
| 13-2041 | Credit Analysts* |
| 15-1141 | Database Administrators* |
| 29-1021 | Dentists, General* |
| 29-1031 | Dietitians and Nutritionists* |
| 21-2021 | Directors, Religious Activities and Education |
| 11-9032 | Education Administrators, Elementary and Secondary School* |
| 11-9033 | Education Administrators, Postsecondary* |
| 11-9031 | Education Administrators, Preschool and Childcare Center/Program* |
| 25-9099 | Education, Training, and Library Workers, All Other |
| 21-1012 | Educational, Guidance, School, and Vocational Counselors* |
| 17-2071 | Electrical Engineers* |
| 17-2072 | Electronics Engineers, Except Computer* |
| 25-2021 | Elementary School Teachers, Except Special Education* |
| 17-2199 | Engineers, All Other* |
| 17-2081 | Environmental Engineers* |
| 19-2041 | Environmental Scientists and Specialists, Including Health* |
| 29-1062 | Family and General Practitioners* |
| 13-2051 | Financial Analysts* |
| 11-3031 | Financial Managers |
| 13-2099 | Financial Specialists, All Other* |
| 13-1131 | Fundraisers |
| 11-1021 | General and Operations Managers* |
| 21-1091 | Health Educators* |
| 21-1022 | Healthcare Social Workers |
| 11-3121 | Human Resources Managers* |
| 13-1071 | Human Resources Specialists |
| 17-2112 | Industrial Engineers |


| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 25-9031 | Instructional Coordinators |
| 25-2012 | Kindergarten Teachers, Except Special Education |
| 23-1011 | Lawyers* |
| 25-4021 | Librarians |
| 13-1111 | Management Analysts* |
| 11-9199 | Managers, All Other* |
| 13-1161 | Market Research Analysts and Marketing Specialists |
| 11-2021 | Marketing Managers* |
| 21-1013 | Marriage and Family Therapists |
| 17-2141 | Mechanical Engineers* |
| 11-9111 | Medical and Health Services Managers* |
| 19-1042 | Medical Scientists, Except Epidemiologists* |
| 13-1121 | Meeting, Convention, and Event Planners |
| 21-1023 | Mental Health and Substance Abuse Social Workers |
| 21-1014 | Mental Health Counselors* |
| 19-1022 | Microbiologists |
| 25-2022 | Middle School Teachers, Except Special and Career/Technical Education* |
| 27-2041 | Music Directors and Composers |
| 11-9121 | Natural Sciences Managers* |
| 29-1171 | Nurse Practitioners |
| 29-1122 | Occupational Therapists* |
| 15-2031 | Operations Research Analysts* |
| 13-2052 | Personal Financial Advisors* |
| 29-1051 | Pharmacists* |
| 29-1123 | Physical Therapists* |
| 29-1071 | Physician Assistants* |
| 29-1069 | Physicians and Surgeons, All Other* |
| 25-1099 | Postsecondary Teachers* |
| 21-1092 | Probation Officers and Correctional Treatment Specialists* |
| 27-3031 | Public Relations Specialists* |
| 11-3061 | Purchasing Managers |
| 41-9031 | Sales Engineers |
| 11-2022 | Sales Managers* |
| 41-4011 | Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Technical and Scientific Products |
| 25-2031 | Secondary School Teachers, Except Special and Career/Technical Education* |
| 41-3031 | Securities, Commodities, and Financial Services Sales Agents |
| 11-9151 | Social and Community Service Managers* |
| 15-1132 | Software Developers, Applications* |
| 15-1133 | Software Developers, Systems Software* |
| 25-2052 | Special Education Teachers, Kindergarten and Elementary School* |
| 25-2053 | Special Education Teachers, Middle School* |
| 25-2054 | Special Education Teachers, Secondary School* |
| 29-1127 | Speech-Language Pathologists* |
| 21-1011 | Substance Abuse and Behavioral Disorder Counselors* |
| 25-3098 | Substitute Teachers |
| 25-3099 | Teachers and Instructors, All Other |
| 27-3042 | Technical Writers |
| 19-3051 | Urban and Regional Planners |
| 29-1131 | Veterinarians* |
| 27-3043 | Writers and Authors* |

## Defining Supply Gaps

To determine whether an occupation has a supply gap, simply subtract the labor supply from labor demand. For the purpose of this study, labor supply is defined as the number of completions or awards that the region produces for an occupation, and labor demand is defined as the number of annual openings for an occupation.

There are two sources of supply data that the COE analyzed for this study: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office Management Information System (MIS) Data Mart and Economic Modeling Specialists Int'l (Emsi). Supply data in Emsi originates from Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS), which uses Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes. Conversely, supply data in the MIS Data Mart uses Taxonomy of Programs (TOP) codes. Different coding systems result in differences in supply numbers and, ultimately, supply gaps. For example, according to Emsi, there is an oversupply of workers for Registered Nurses. However, according to Data Mart, there is a supply gap:

| SOC Code | Occupational Title | 2017-2022 <br> Annual <br> Openings | 2017 Regional <br> Completions <br> (Emsi) | Supply Gap or <br> Oversupply <br> (Emsi) | PY2013-15 <br> 3-Yr Average <br> Supply | Supply Gap or <br> Oversupply |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| (Data Mart) |  |  |  |  |  |  |

In this study, the COE determined that only occupations with an oversupply of workers in both Emsi and Data Mart would be considered occupations that had an oversupply of workers. Because Data Mart is more up to date (see Differences Between Data Mart and IPEDS section below), if the occupation had an oversupply in Emsi and a supply gap in Data Mart, then that occupation would be considered to have a supply gap.

## Data Mart Limitations:

- Data is provided as yearly snapshots, rather than following a cohort of students over time.
- Data on local low-unit certificate programs may be missing because districts are not required to report such data to the Chancellor's Office.
- Program award data is based on the number of awards given, rather than the number of students who received awards, which affects estimates of the supply of qualified workers.
- All information is based on a single TOP code, which may not align directly with colleges or their programs.

Emsi or IPEDS Limitations:

- Program completion data is not complete, likely related to reporting errors and compliance issues.
- Educational programs that do not participate in federal student aid programs are not included in the database.
- Program completion data are reported by CIP codes, not the TOP codes used by California community colleges.


## Differences Between Data Mart and IPEDS:

- Academic years for which the number of awards is reported in IPEDS and Data Mart differ because of the longer time lag for IPEDS data. The COE supply tables use the latest available datasets; therefore, the data for the most recent academic year (e.g., 2015-2016) may be representative of community college awards only because IPEDS data for the same academic year might not be available yet.
- The COE supply tables are organized by TOP code program. To provide the number of awards for postsecondary institutions other than community colleges, TOP codes were cross-referenced with relevant CIP codes. This match is imperfect, with gaps and overlaps between the two coding systems.
- There is inconsistency in the classification of awards below an associate degree between the two data sources. IPEDS classifies certificate-level awards by program duration (e.g., award $1<2$ academic year, award $<1$ academic year, etc.), while Data Mart classifies data by type of certificate in semester units (e.g., certificate 30 to $<60$ semester units, certificate 6 to $<18$ semester units). Because of these differences in certificate-level award classification, it is difficult to compare certificate completion between community colleges and other postsecondary education providers.


## Appendix C: Top 100 Middle-Skill Jobs in San Diego County

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { SOC } \\ & \text { Code } \end{aligned}$ | Occupational Title | \# Jobs <br> (Employed) in 2017 | $\begin{aligned} & 2017-2022 \\ & \text { \% Jobs } \\ & \text { Change } \end{aligned}$ | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | Entry-Level Hourly Earnings | Median Hourly Earnings | Typical Entry-Level Education + On-the-Job Training (OJT) + Work Experience (Exp.) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 43-4051 | Customer Service Representatives | 20,718 | 6\% | 2,920 | \$13.84 | \$17.52 | HS (HS) diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 43-6014 | Secretaries and Administrative Assistants, Except Legal, Medical, and Executive | 22,598 | 5\% | 2,683 | \$15.16 | \$18.42 | HS diploma or equivalent <br> + Short-term OJT |
| 29-1141 | Registered Nurses | 24,587 | 11\% | 1,810 | \$34.85 | \$43.63 | Bachelor's degree |
| 43-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Office and Administrative Support Workers | 15,234 | 7\% | 1,743 | \$21.23 | \$26.37 | HS diploma or equivalent <br> + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 41-3099 | Sales Representatives, Services, All Other | 12,347 | 4\% | 1,578 | \$16.97 | \$24.10 | HS diploma or equivalent <br> + Moderate-term OJT |
| 41-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Retail Sales Workers | 13,540 | 3\% | 1,542 | \$13.55 | \$17.77 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 13-1199 | Business Operations Specialists, All Other | 14,217 | 5\% | 1,439 | \$25.84 | \$35.66 | Bachelor's degree |
| 49-9071 | Maintenance and Repair Workers, General | 11,493 | 7\% | 1,303 | \$14.68 | \$18.48 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 31-9092 | Medical Assistants | 7,545 | 21\% | 1,180 | \$14.88 | \$17.23 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters | 11,831 | 3\% | 1,178 | \$14.04 | \$18.40 | HS diploma or equivalent + Apprenticeship |
| 41-4012 | Sales Representatives, Wholesale and Manufacturing, Except Technical and Scientific Products | 10,281 | 4\% | 1,132 | \$18.43 | \$25.20 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 43-6013 | Medical Secretaries | 7,369 | 15\% | 1,058 | \$15.59 | \$18.99 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 47-2111 | Electricians | 7,302 | 13\% | 1,026 | \$22.44 | \$29.06 | HS diploma or equivalent + Apprenticeship |
| 53-3032 | Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers | 8,431 | 5\% | 988 | \$15.63 | \$18.72 | Postsecondary non-degree award + Short-term OJT |
| 39-9031 | Fitness Trainers and Aerobics Instructors | 4,157 | 13\% | 835 | \$13.10 | \$20.09 | HS diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 47-2152 | Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters | 5,941 | 13\% | 799 | \$17.90 | \$24.73 | HS diploma or equivalent + Apprenticeship |
| 43-6011 | Executive Secretaries and Executive Administrative Assistants | 7,170 | 0\% | 768 | \$22.92 | \$28.25 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 47-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Construction Trades and Extraction Workers | 6,570 | 5\% | 732 | \$24.38 | \$34.36 | HS diploma or equivalent + 5 years exp. or more |
| 51-9061 | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers | 5,113 | 4\% | 650 | \$14.84 | \$19.62 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 29-2061 | Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses | 5,627 | 19\% | 645 | \$22.24 | \$25.99 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 41-3021 | Insurance Sales Agents | 4,954 | 6\% | 554 | \$19.38 | \$23.01 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 15-1151 | Computer User Support Specialists | 6,250 | 7\% | 548 | \$22.29 | \$27.05 | Some college, no degree |
| 31-9091 | Dental Assistants | 3,730 | 14\% | 533 | \$ 16.05 | \$19.69 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 43-5061 | Production, Planning, and Expediting Clerks | 4,539 | 4\% | 505 | \$17.03 | \$22.18 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 51-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Production and Operating Workers | 4,530 | 3\% | 474 | \$20.53 | \$28.80 | HS diploma or equivalent +5 years exp. or more |
| 51-4041 | Machinists | 3,603 | 10\% | 447 | \$16.91 | \$23.72 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 33-3051 | Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers | 5,089 | 7\% | 398 | \$32.35 | \$39.41 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 23-2011 | Paralegals and Legal Assistants | 3,446 | 6\% | 397 | \$24.49 | \$30.52 | Associate degree |


| SOC <br> Code | Occupational Title | \# Jobs <br> (Employed) <br> in 2017 | $\begin{aligned} & 2017-2022 \\ & \text { \% Jobs } \\ & \text { Change } \end{aligned}$ | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | Entry-Level Hourly Earnings | Median Hourly Earnings | Typical Entry-Level Education + On-the-Job Training (OJT) + Work Experience (Exp.) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 51-4121 | Welders, Cutters, Solderers, and Brazers | 3,388 | 5\% | 397 | \$17.06 | \$23.14 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate OJT |
| 21-1093 | Social and Human Service Assistants | 2,513 | 15\% | 391 | \$13.70 | \$16.82 | HS diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 13-1023 | Purchasing Agents, Except Wholesale, Retail, and Farm Products | 4,042 | 5\% | 390 | \$24.94 | \$33.82 | Bachelor's degree + Long-term OJT |
| 11-9021 | Construction Managers | 5,143 | 0\% | 374 | \$ 18.72 | \$36.15 | Bachelor's degree + Moderate term OJT |
| 53-3022 | Bus Drivers, School or Special Client | 2,107 | 20\% | 358 | \$13.80 | \$17.54 | HS diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 51-2022 | Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers | 2,921 | 2\% | 357 | \$13.17 | \$17.33 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics and Installers | 2,505 | 18\% | 348 | \$16.90 | \$26.03 | Postsecondary non-degree award + Long-term OJT |
| 41-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Non-Retail Sales Workers | 3,709 | 0\% | 341 | \$17.18 | \$23.73 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 13-1051 | Cost Estimators | 2,971 | 8\% | 341 | \$25.15 | \$31.84 | Bachelor's degree |
| 11-3011 | Administrative Services Managers | 3,662 | 6\% | 339 | \$31.25 | \$39.63 | Bachelor's degree + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 15-1199 | Computer Occupations, All Other | 4,410 | 3\% | 326 | \$28.82 | \$41.93 | Bachelor's degree |
| 11-9141 | Property, Real Estate, and Community Association Managers | 4,134 | 1\% | 324 | \$19.78 | \$23.20 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 29-2052 | Pharmacy Technicians | 3,312 | 6\% | 304 | \$13.76 | \$17.01 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate OJT |
| 49-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Mechanics, Installers, and Repairers | 2,954 | 7\% | 299 | \$25.01 | \$31.47 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 43-6012 | Legal Secretaries | 2,734 | 1\% | 296 | \$18.98 | \$22.53 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate OJT |
| 47-2211 | Sheet Metal Workers | 2,361 | 9\% | 295 | \$18.71 | \$27.19 | HS diploma or equivalent + Apprenticeship |
| 35-1011 | Chefs and Head Cooks | 1,927 | 11\% | 290 | \$16.14 | \$18.69 | HS diploma or equivalent +5 years or more exp. |
| 39-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Personal Service Workers | 2,248 | 13\% | 288 | \$13.50 | \$18.47 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 13-1081 | Logisticians | 2,518 | 7\% | 281 | \$32.88 | \$40.86 | Bachelor's degree |
| 33-3012 | Correctional Officers and Jailers | 2,690 | 8\% | 266 | \$27.82 | \$33.83 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 13-2072 | Loan Officers | 2,979 | 3\% | 264 | \$25.74 | \$36.57 | Bachelor's degree + Moderate-term OJT |
| 17-3023 | Electrical and Electronics Engineering Technicians | 2,945 | 1\% | 260 | \$24.61 | \$30.78 | Associate degree |
| 31-9099 | Healthcare Support Workers, All Other | 1,844 | 7\% | 259 | \$16.75 | \$20.06 | HS diploma or equivalent |
| 47-2073 | Operating Engineers and Other Construction Equipment Operators | 2,078 | 6\% | 256 | \$23.44 | \$28.12 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 13-1031 | Claims Adjusters, Examiners, and Investigators | 2,995 | 2\% | 255 | \$23.78 | \$30.84 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 13-1151 | Training and Development Specialists | 2,257 | 7\% | 252 | \$26.62 | \$33.96 | Bachelor's degree + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 15-1142 | Network and Computer Systems Administrators | 3,384 | 6\% | 251 | \$31.60 | \$39.31 | Bachelor's degree |
| 15-1134 | Web Developers | 2,723 | 8\% | 239 | \$16.24 | \$21.55 | Associate degree |
| 33-2011 | Firefighters | 3,061 | 6\% | 237 | \$23.79 | \$29.28 | Postsecondary non-degree award + Long-term OJT |
| 29-2012 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technicians | 2,409 | 15\% | 228 | \$14.47 | \$21.24 | Associate degree |


| $\begin{aligned} & \text { SOC } \\ & \text { Code } \end{aligned}$ | Occupational Title | \# Jobs <br> (Employed) <br> in 2017 | $2017-2022$ <br> \% Jobs <br> Change | $2017-22$ <br> Annual Openings | Entry-Level <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Median <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Typical Entry-Level Education + On-the-Job Training (OJT) + Work Experience (Exp.) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 33-3021 | Detectives and Criminal Investigators | 3,284 | 3\% | 228 | \$40.96 | \$42.20 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate OJT + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 29-2099 | Health Technologists and Technicians, All Other | 1,960 | 24\% | 227 | \$16.80 | \$20.86 | HS diploma or equivalent |
| 49-9041 | Industrial Machinery Mechanics | 1,957 | 13\% | 227 | \$22.65 | \$26.80 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 27-4021 | Photographers | 2,116 | 10\% | 219 | \$14.02 | \$16.73 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 31-9097 | Phlebotomists | 1,350 | 22\% | 211 | \$16.43 | \$18.78 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 29-2021 | Dental Hygienists | 2,278 | 14\% | 205 | \$39.45 | \$44.09 | Associate degree |
| 43-3051 | Payroll and Timekeeping Clerks | 1,994 | 1\% | 201 | \$18.78 | \$22.53 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 49-3031 | Bus and Truck Mechanics and Diesel Engine Specialists | 1,740 | 11\% | 200 | \$16.91 | \$23.25 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 43-4131 | Loan Interviewers and Clerks | 1,731 | 5\% | 186 | \$16.47 | \$20.78 | HS diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 43-4161 | Human Resources Assistants, Except Payroll and Timekeeping | 1,627 | 1\% | 182 | \$17.21 | \$20.69 | Associate degree |
| 43-4181 | Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks | 1,436 | 9\% | 180 | \$13.83 | \$18.46 | HS diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 27-3091 | Interpreters and Translators | 1,444 | 15\% | 179 | \$20.33 | \$24.10 | Bachelor's degree + Short-term OJT |
| 29-2071 | Medical Records and Health Information Technicians | 2,104 | 11\% | 178 | \$15.32 | \$21.40 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 49-3021 | Automotive Body and Related Repairers | 1,523 | 9\% | 176 | \$13.92 | \$17.38 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 37-1012 | First-Line Supervisors of Landscaping, Lawn Service, and Groundskeeping Workers | 1,750 | 1\% | 171 | \$14.74 | \$17.35 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 51-4011 | Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators, Metal and Plastic | 1,207 | 16\% | 165 | \$15.43 | \$20.65 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 25-4031 | Library Technicians | 1,123 | 6\% | 164 | \$16.85 | \$20.85 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 47-4011 | Construction and Building Inspectors | 1,289 | 5\% | 155 | \$26.18 | \$33.83 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT + 5 years or more exp. |
| 53-1031 | First-Line Supervisors of Transportation and Material-Moving Machine and Vehicle Operators | 1,286 | 7\% | 153 | \$18.25 | \$26.64 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 13-1022 | Wholesale and Retail Buyers, Except Farm Products | 1,241 | 4\% | 152 | \$21.25 | \$23.42 | Bachelor's degree + Long-term OJT |
| 17-3029 | Engineering Technicians, Except Drafters, All Other | 1,609 | 3\% | 150 | \$25.92 | \$31.29 | Associate degree |
| 17-3011 | Architectural and Civil Drafters | 1,638 | 2\% | 146 | \$23.18 | \$27.71 | Associate degree |
| 15-1152 | Computer Network Support Specialists | 1,728 | 5\% | 145 | \$25.36 | \$31.24 | Associate degree |
| 11-3051 | Industrial Production Managers | 1,790 | 5\% | 144 | \$36.44 | \$46.10 | Bachelor's degree +5 years or more OJT |
| 53-1021 | First-Line Supervisors of Helpers, Laborers, and Material Movers, Hand | 1,308 | 3\% | 143 | \$17.37 | \$21.50 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 51-2011 | Aircraft Structure, Surfaces, Rigging, and Systems Assemblers | 801 | 30\% | 142 | \$17.23 | \$21.73 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 13-2082 | Tax Preparers | 1,205 | 5\% | 141 | \$17.95 | \$22.03 | HS diploma or equivalent + Moderate-term OJT |
| 49-3011 | Aircraft Mechanics and Service Technicians | 1,213 | 16\% | 137 | \$25.08 | \$29.87 | Postsecondary non-degree award |


| SOC Code | Occupational Title | \# Jobs <br> (Employed) <br> in 2017 | $\begin{aligned} & 2017-2022 \\ & \text { \% Jobs } \\ & \text { Change } \end{aligned}$ | 2017-22 <br> Annual Openings | Entry-Level <br> Hourly <br> Earnings | Median Hourly Earnings | Typical Entry-Level Education + On-the-Job Training (OJT) + Work Experience (Exp.) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 29-2011 | Medical and Clinical Laboratory Technologists | 1,344 | 17\% | 135 | \$29.95 | \$37.04 | Bachelor's degree |
| 29-2034 | Radiologic Technologists | 1,503 | 16\% | 129 | \$26.49 | \$34.61 | Associate degree |
| 19-4099 | Life, Physical, and Social Science Technicians, All Other | 977 | 5\% | 126 | \$17.26 | \$22.99 | Associate degree |
| 29-2056 | Veterinary Technologists and Technicians | 963 | 22\% | 125 | \$16.29 | \$20.27 | Associate degree |
| 31-2021 | Physical Therapist Assistants | 596 | 34\% | 122 | \$25.32 | \$32.56 | Associate degree |
| 43-5011 | Cargo and Freight Agents | 1,031 | 15\% | 120 | \$17.01 | \$21.42 | HS diploma or equivalent + Short-term OJT |
| 11-9081 | Lodging Managers | 978 | 6\% | 113 | \$20.24 | \$26.95 | HS diploma or equivalent + Less than 5 years exp. |
| 51-8031 | Water \& Wastewater Treatment Plant and System Operators | 1,089 | 6\% | 104 | \$25.10 | \$30.37 | HS diploma or equivalent + Long-term OJT |
| 47-2221 | Structural Iron and Steel Workers | 916 | 3\% | 103 | \$20.08 | \$30.48 | HS diploma or equivalent + Apprenticeship |
| 17-3022 | Civil Engineering Technicians | 1,019 | 6\% | 102 | \$22.90 | \$27.88 | Associate degree |
| 15-1143 | Computer Network Architects | 1,280 | 7\% | 101 | \$39.69 | \$50.71 | Bachelor's degree +5 years or more OJT |
| 29-2055 | Surgical Technologists | 942 | 13\% | 101 | \$22.33 | \$26.59 | Postsecondary non-degree award |
| 47-2121 | Glaziers | 820 | 3\% | 99 | \$16.69 | \$24.43 | HS diploma or equivalent + Apprenticeship |
| 11-3071 | Transportation, Storage, and Distribution Managers | 1,119 | 6\% | 99 | \$33.93 | \$41.95 | HS diploma or equivalent +5 years or more exp. |

Source: Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2007-2022.


CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES SAN DIEGO
IMPERIAL
COUNTIES
REGIONAL
CONSORTIUM


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ San Diego Workforce Partnership. San Diego County - Middle-Skill Jobs: Gaps and Opportunities. November 2015. workforce.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/reports/industry/middle-skill_jobs_gaps_and_opportunities_2015.pdf
    ${ }^{2}$ The Self-Sufficiency Standard determines the hourly wages that a single adult needs to earn in order to meet basic needs and is based on real-world assumptions of the costs of food, health care, transportation, housing, etc. that vary over time and across geographic locations. selfsufficiencystandard.org ${ }^{3}$ Also known as Career Technical Education or CTE programs
    ${ }^{4}$ Economic and Workforce Development Program. Annual Report. California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office. 2017.
    ${ }^{5}$ brookings.edu/blog/brown-center-chalkboard/2018/02/09/gainfully-employed-new-evidence-on-the-earnings-employment-and-debt-of-for-profit-certificate-students

[^1]:    ${ }^{6}$ Economic Modeling Specialists, Int’l. (Emsi). San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+Self-employed. $2007-2022$.
    7 Hourly earnings are the wages per hour, excluding benefits, of a worker in an occupation. Median hourly earnings are in the middle of the wage distribution for an occupation: half of the workers make more, half of them make less.
    ${ }^{8}$ The Self-Sufficiency Standard determines the hourly wages that an individual needs to earn in order to meet basic needs. selfsufficiencystandard.org
    ${ }^{9}$ Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2007-2022.
    10 Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2017-2022.

[^2]:    ${ }^{11}$ Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2007-2022.

[^3]:    ${ }^{12}$ Economic and Workforce Development Program. Annual Report. California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office. 2017.

[^4]:    ${ }^{13}$ EMSI

[^5]:    ${ }^{14}$ Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2007-2022. Jobs multiplier data is based on Emsi's model, which incorporates data from the Bureau of Economic Analysis.

[^6]:    ${ }^{15}$ calpassplus.org/MediaLibrary/calpassplus/publicweb/Documents/sector-explanation.docx

[^7]:    16 calpassplus.org/MediaLibrary/calpassplus/publicweb/Documents/sector-explanation.docx

[^8]:    17 doingwhatmatters.cccco.edu/ForCollegeLeadership/SkillsBuilders.aspx
    ${ }^{18}$ Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2007-2022.
    19 Emsi. San Diego County (6073). 2017.04 Class of Worker. QCEW + Non-QCEW+ Self-employed. 2007-2022.

[^9]:    ${ }^{20}$ coeccc.net
    ${ }^{21}$ bls.gov/soc

